

DOE Workbook

CONDUCTING ACCIDENT INVESTIGATIONS

REVISION 2

May 1, 1999

**U.S. Department of Energy
Washington, D.C. 20585**



*DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT
Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword

Introduction

♦ ♦ ♦

Part I – The Context of DOE's Accident Investigation Program

Section 1 – Accidents: General Principles

1.1 The Nature of Accidents	1-1
1.2 Human Factors Considerations	1-1
1.2.1 Human-Machine Interface	1-2
1.2.2 Human Capabilities	1-3
1.2.3 Equipment/Design Considerations	1-4
1.2.4 Physical Work Environment	1-4
1.2.5 Organizational Work Environment	1-6
Key Points to Remember	1-8

Section 2 – DOE's Accident Investigation Program

2.1 Overall Management of the Program	2-1
2.2 Roles and Responsibilities of Key Participants	2-1
2.2.1 Appointing Officials and Line Management Participants	2-2
2.2.2 The Accident Investigation Board	2-3
2.3 Site Readiness	2-6
2.3.1 Readiness — What Is It?	2-6
2.3.2 Establishing Written Procedures and Responsibilities	2-8
2.3.3 Maintaining Resources to Support Accident Investigations	2-8
2.3.4 Training for Site Readiness	2-8
2.3.5 Conducting Periodic Practices and Evaluations	2-9
2.4 Accident Investigation Process Overview	2-9

2.5 Waivers	2-11
2.6 Limited Scope Accident Investigations	2-12
Key Points to Remember	2-13



Part II – The Accident Investigation Process

Section 3 – Appointing the Investigation Board

3.1 Establishing the Accident Investigation Board and Its Authority	3-1
3.2 Briefing the Board	3-2
Key Points to Remember	3-3

Section 4 – Implementing Site Readiness

4.1 Immediate Post-Accident Actions	4-1
4.2 Preserving and Documenting the Accident Scene	4-2
4.2.1 Securing and Preserving the Scene	4-2
4.2.2 Documenting the Scene	4-3
4.3 Collecting, Preserving, and Controlling Evidence	4-3
4.4 Obtaining Initial Witness Statements	4-4
4.5 Transferring Information to the Board	4-5
Key Points to Remember	4-7

Section 5 – Managing the Accident Investigation

5.1 Project Planning	5-1
5.1.1 Collecting Initial Site Information	5-1
5.1.2 Determining Task Assignments	5-1
5.1.3 Preparing a Schedule	5-2
5.1.4 Acquiring Resources	5-3
5.1.5 Addressing Potential Conflicts of Interest	5-3
5.1.6 Establishing Information Access and Release Protocols	5-3
5.2 Managing the Investigation Process	5-6
5.2.1 Taking Control of the Accident Scene	5-6

5.2.2 Initial Meeting of the Investigation Board	5-6
5.2.3 Promoting Teamwork	5-7
5.2.4 Managing Information Collection	5-9
5.2.5 Coordinating Internal and External Communication	5-9
5.2.6 Managing the Analysis	5-11
5.2.7 Managing Report Writing	5-12
5.2.8 Managing Onsite Closeout Activities	5-13
5.2.9 Managing Post-Investigation Activities	5-13
 5.3 Controlling the Investigation Process	 5-14
5.3.1 Monitoring Performance and Providing Feedback.....	5-14
5.3.2 Controlling Cost and Schedule	5-14
5.3.3 Assuring Quality	5-15
 Key Points to Remember	 5-16

Section 6 – Collecting Data

6.1 Collecting Human Evidence	6-2
6.1.1 Locating Witnesses	6-2
6.1.2 Conducting Interviews	6-2
 6.2 Collecting Physical Evidence	 6-6
6.2.1 Documenting Physical Evidence	6-7
6.2.2 Inspecting Physical Evidence	6-9
6.2.3 Removing Physical Evidence	6-10
 6.3 Collecting Documentary Evidence	 6-10
6.4 Examining Organizational Concerns, Management Systems, and Line Management Oversight	6-11
6.5 Preserving and Controlling Evidence	6-12
 Key Points to Remember	 6-17

Section 7 – Analyzing Data

7.1 Determining Facts	7-1
7.2 Determining Causal Factors	7-2
7.2.1 Direct Cause	7-2
7.2.2 Contributing Causes	7-3
7.2.3 Root Causes	7-4
7.2.4 The Importance of Causal Factors	7-5
 7.3 Using the Core Analytical Techniques	 7-5
7.3.1 Events and Causal Factors Charting	7-5
7.3.2 Barrier Analysis	7-8

7.3.3 Change Analysis	7-15
7.3.4 Events and Causal Factors Analysis	7-21
7.3.5 Root Cause Analysis	7-25
7.4 Using Advanced Analytic Methods	7-39
7.4.1 Analytic Trees	7-40
7.4.2 Management Oversight and Risk Tree Analysis (MORT)	7-44
7.4.3 Project Evaluation Tree (PET) Analysis	7-47
7.5 Other Analytic Techniques	7-52
7.5.1 Time Loss Analysis	7-52
7.5.2 Human Factors Analysis	7-52
7.5.3 Integrated Accident Event Matrix	7-53
7.5.4 Failure Modes and Effects Analysis	7-53
7.5.5 Software Hazards Analysis	7-54
7.5.6 Common Cause Failure Analysis	7-54
7.5.7 Sneak Circuit Analysis	7-54
7.5.8 Materials and Structural Analysis	7-54
7.5.9 Design Criteria Analysis	7-54
7.5.10 Accident Reconstruction	7-54
7.5.11 Scientific Modeling	7-54
Key Points to Remember	7-56

Section 8 – Developing Conclusions and Judgments of Need

8.1 Conclusions	8-1
8.2 Judgments of Need	8-2
8.3 Minority Opinions	8-4
Key Points to Remember	8-5

Section 9 – Reporting the Results

9.1 Writing the Report	9-1
9.2 Report Format and Content	9-1
9.2.1 Disclaimer	9-3
9.2.2 Appointing Official's Statement of Report Acceptance	9-3
9.2.3 Table of Contents	9-4
9.2.4 Acronyms and Initialisms	9-4
9.2.5 Prologue—Interpretation of Significance	9-5
9.2.6 Executive Summary	9-5
9.2.7 Introduction	9-6
9.2.8 Facts and Analysis	9-6
9.2.9 Conclusions and Judgments of Need	9-12
9.2.10 Minority Report	9-13
9.2.11 Board Signatures	9-13

9.2.12 Board Members, Advisors, Consultants, and Staff	9-13
9.2.13 Appendices	9-13
9.3 Performing Quality Review and Validation of Conclusions	9-13
9.4 Conducting the Factual Accuracy Review	9-16
9.5 Review by the Assistant Secretary for Environment, Safety and Health	9-16
9.6 Submitting the Report	9-17
Key Points to Remember	9-18



Appendices

Appendix A — Glossary
Appendix B — References
Appendix C — Specific Administrative Needs
Appendix D — Safety Management System
Appendix E — Subject Index



List of Tables

Table 1-1. Human capabilities contribute to work performance	1-4
Table 1-2. Equipment design can affect human performance	1-5
Table 2-1. Appointing officials and line management participants in accident investigations have clearly defined responsibilities	2-2
Table 2-2. The accident investigation board has these major responsibilities	2-3
Table 2-3. The timeline for a Type A or Type B accident investigation requires conducting multiple simultaneous tasks	2-11
Table 3-1. Board members must meet these criteria	3-2
Table 4-1. Several types of witnesses should provide preliminary statements	4-5
Table 5-1. These activities should be included on an accident investigation schedule	5-2
Table 5-2. The chairperson establishes protocols for controlling information	5-5
Table 5-3. The chairperson should use these guidelines in managing information collection activities	5-10
Table 5-4. The Price-Anderson Amendments Act of 1988	5-11
Table 6-1. These sources are useful for locating witnesses	6-3
Table 6-2. It is important to prepare for interviews	6-3
Table 6-3. Group and individual interviews have different advantages	6-4
Table 6-4. Interviewing do's	6-5
Table 6-5. Interviewing don'ts	6-6
Table 6-6. Use these universal precautions when handling potential bloodborne pathogens	6-8
Table 6-7. These are typical questions for addressing the five core functions of integrated safety management	6-13
Table 6-8. These are typical questions for addressing the seven guiding principles of integrated safety management	6-14

Table 7-1.	Case study introduction	7-3
Table 7-2.	Benefits of events and causal factors charting	7-6
Table 7-3.	Guidelines and symbols for preparing an events and causal factors chart	7-8
Table 7-4.	Sample barrier analysis worksheet	7-16
Table 7-5.	Sample change analysis worksheet	7-22
Table 7-6.	Case Study: Change analysis summary	7-23
Table 7-7.	Tier diagram worksheet for a contractor organization	7-28
Table 7-8.	Example tier diagram approach	7-30
Table 7-9.	Compliance/noncompliance root cause model categories	7-38
Table 7-10.	MORT color coding system	7-47

Table 8-1.	These guidelines are useful for writing judgments of need	8-3
Table 8-2.	Case Study: Judgments of need	8-4

Table 9-1.	Useful strategies for drafting the investigation report	9-2
Table 9-2.	The accident investigation report should include these items	9-2
Table 9-3.	Facts differ from analysis	9-10



List of Figures

Figure 1-1.	Human-machine “activity model”	1-2
-------------	--------------------------------------	-----

Figure 2-1.	The process used to conduct an accident investigation involves many activities	2-10
Figure 2-2.	The three primary activity phases in an accident investigation overlap significantly	2-11

Figure 5-1.	A typical schedule of accident investigation activities covers 30 days	5-4
-------------	--	-----

Figure 7-1.	Simplified events and causal factors chart	7-7
Figure 7-2.	Sample of an events and causal factors chart (in progress)	7-9
Figure 7-3.	Barriers are intended to protect personnel and property against hazards	7-13
Figure 7-4.	Barriers to protect workers from hazards	7-14
Figure 7-5.	Summary results from a barrier analysis reveal the types of barriers involved	7-17
Figure 7-6.	Summary results from a barrier analysis can highlight the role of the core functions in an accident	7-18
Figure 7-7.	The change analysis process is relatively simple	7-20
Figure 7-8.	Events and causal factors analysis; driving events to causal factors	7-24
Figure 7-9.	Grouping root causes on the events and causal factor chart	7-25
Figure 7-10.	Identifying the linkages on the tier diagram	7-35
Figure 7-11.	The analytic tree process begins with the accident as the top event	7-40
Figure 7-12.	Analytic trees are constructed using symbols	7-43
Figure 7-13.	The layout of an analytic tree shows logical relationships	7-45
Figure 7-14.	A completed analytic tree shows the flow of lower-tier elements to the top event	7-46
Figure 7-15.	The initial MORT chart uses logic symbols	7-48
Figure 7-16.	The accident description can be shown on a MORT chart	7-49
Figure 7-17.	Management system factors can be shown on a MORT chart	7-50
Figure 7-18.	This branch of the PET chart deals with procedures	7-51

Figure 7-19. Time loss analysis can be used when emergency response is in question	7-53
Figure 8-1. Facts, analyses, and causal factors are needed to support judgments of need	8-3



List of Forms and Tools

Accident Investigation Equipment Checklist	2-15
Accident Investigation "Go Kit" Contents.....	2-20
Accident Investigation Preliminary Interview List	4-9
Accident Investigation Witness Statement Form	4-10
Accident Investigation Startup Activities List	5-19
Accident Investigation Information Request Form	5-22
Individual Conflict of Interest Certification Form	5-23
Accident Investigation Interview Schedule Form	6-19
Accident Investigation Interview Form	6-20
Model Opening Statement	6-21
Accident Investigation Physical Evidence Log Form	6-22
Accident Investigation Site Sketch	6-23
Accident Investigation Site Map	6-24
Accident Investigation Position Mapping Form	6-25
Accident Investigation Sketch of Physical Evidence Locations and Orientations	6-26
Accident Investigation Photographic Log Sheet	6-27
Accident Investigation Sketch of Photography Locations and Orientations	6-28
Barrier Analysis Worksheet	7-58
Change Analysis Worksheet	7-59
PET Analysis Worksheet	7-60